



SHAKER HEIGHTS

**Civil Service Commission Agenda
City Hall Conference Room B
Wednesday, February 27, 2019, 3:00 p.m.**

1. Approval of April 16, 2018 meeting minutes.

Documents:

[18-04-18 DRAFT.DOC -FINAL.PDF](#)

2. Discussion of Fire Lieutenant Promotional process.
Exhibit 1: 2019 Tentative Time Line

Documents:

[2019 TENTATIVE TIME LINE.PDF](#)

3. Recommendation and approval of the Reading List for Fire Lieutenant promotional test
4. Recommendation to cancel current Police entry-level eligibility list.
Exhibit 2: 2017 Eligibility List
Exhibit 3: Test Cycle Outcomes 2017

Documents:

[2017 ELIIBILITY LIST.PDF](#)
[TEST CYCLE OUTCOMES2017.PDF](#)

5. Overview and discussion of recommended Police entry-level process.
Exhibit 4: 2017 Police Officer Examination
Exhibit 5:2019 Police Entry-Level Exam Cost

Documents:

[2017 POLICE OFFICER EXAMINATION.PDF](#)
[2019 POLICE ENTRY-LEVEL EXAM COST.PDF](#)

6. Recommendation and approval of testing company.
7. Schedule next meeting date and time.
8. Adjournment

To request an accommodation for a person with a disability, call the City's ADA Coordinator at 216-491-1440, or Ohio Relay Service at 711 for TTY users.



SHAKER HEIGHTS

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES OF THE MEETING April 16, 2018 at 3:00 p.m. City Hall – Council Chambers

Members Present: Sandra I. Kiely, Chairperson
Lee A. Trotter
Jeri E. Chaikin, Secretary

Also Present: David E. Weiss, Mayor
William Ondrey Gruber, Director of Law
Jeffrey N. DeMuth, Chief of Police
Patrick Sweeney, Chief of Fire
James Heath, Assistant Chief of Fire
Sandra Middleton, Human Resources Manager
Patricia McCreary, Human Resources Senior Admin.

Others Present: Kurt Falke, Police Detective
Kevin Ishler, Police Officer
Patrick Carlozzi, Police Detective
Eric Conwell, Police Detective

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Sandra Kiely at 3:00 p.m.

* * * *

Approval of both October 18, 2017 and February 12, 2018 Meeting Minutes

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve the October 18, 2017 and February 12, 2018 meeting minutes, moved by Commissioner Trotter, seconded by Commissioner Kiely and the minutes were approved.

* * * *

Discussion of Police Promotional Examination Results

Chief DeMuth shared that Mr. Brull, test Consultant, used for the current process was used for the last 20 years. The Promotability Index test component will be replaced with the Career Index. Commissioner Kiely asked Chief DeMuth if he was pleased with the process. Chief DeMuth responded “Yes” and stated he was pleased, and mentioned he stayed out of the process. Commissioner Kiely asked Sandra Middleton, Human Resources Manager if she was pleased with the process. Ms. Middleton responded overall, yes. Some noted changes are necessary for next time. Ms. Middleton shared the timeline of events since the meeting on February 12th. The Informational packages went out to eligible candidates on February 14th with applications for all interested in sitting for either exam. The deadline to submit an application was March 2nd; seven applications for the

Lieutenant examination and 12 for Sergeant examination process were received. Ms. Middleton stated one applicant withdrew from the Lieutenant process and two from the Sergeant process. Commissioner Trotter asked if all candidates were internal employees or external. Ms. Middleton responded all were internal and, there were 33 Police Officers/Detectives eligible for the Sergeant's examination; 12 submitted applications and 10 completed the process. You had to be a Sergeant to complete an application for the Lieutenant Exam process. Seven Sergeants submitted an application and six actually completed the process.

Chief DeMuth mentioned we were asked to seek volunteers through the police Facebook page for the Community Presentation. Ms. Middleton shared that we received eight people from the Facebook page. We had three who actually participated in the process; they were Sara Schiavoni, Pat Hoover and Ellen Risen. Chief DeMuth stated this was a great idea for community involvement. Commissioner Kiely stated the community was delighted about the promotional process. Chief DeMuth responded we are probably the only police department in the county that allows community members to take part in the Promotional Panel.

Ms. Middleton stated that along with our community volunteers, we also had the Chief of Police from Notre Dame College, a Lieutenant from Columbus PD, a Commander from RTA, a Lieutenant from the Metroparks, the Chief of Police from Newark, Ohio and the Chief of Police from Bedford Heights serve on our Oral Committee as Assessors. Commissioner Trotter asked if we received any feedback on the process. Ms. Middleton responded they loved the process and did not suggest any improvements. The Chief of Police of Newark and Lieutenant from Metroparks were returning Assessors.

Commissioner Trotter asked when we look at the demographics of the community and at the demographics of the people who responded was there a match or is there something we need to be aware of. Ms. Middleton responded that is something we need to work on. All the volunteers were females. They represented many different neighborhoods in the community and some were minority. Ms. Middleton stated we struggle to get younger people. Mayor David E. Weiss asked what the time commitment was. Ms. Middleton responded one full day. Mayor Weiss asked if we treated this as one of our committees that recruited people. Ms. Middleton stated we normally go through our Citizens Police Academy (CPA) for entry-level process volunteers. The Civil Service Commission asked us to reach beyond the CPA for the Police Promotional process and we turned to the police Facebook page to find volunteers.

Ms. Middleton shared from the timeline. The first test component of the six was scheduled on March 13, 10 Sergeant Candidates participated in Panel Oral Interviews and Community Presentation. On March 28th they participated in the Role Play with community volunteers. The Lieutenants scheduled both the Panel Oral Interviews and Roles Play components on March 27th. All candidates reported to City Hall on March 21st for the Police Career Index (PCI) and In-Basket exercise components, both were written examinations. The Background & Experience forms were due electronically that day. The last component was the Behavioral Personnel Assessment Device (BPAD) that was taken online from each candidate's personal or work computer. The BPAD completion deadline was March 29th. Ms. Middleton stated that the PCI and In-Basket required a lot of writing and some questions were out dated. Ms. Middleton stated she would provide feedback to the testing company about the out dated questions i.e. some mentioned pay telephones. Commissioner Kiely stated it is concerning that out dated information was provided.

Ms. Middleton reminded the Commission that the weights for each test component; Police Career Index 10%, In-Basket 15%, Background and Experience 15%, Oral Panel Interview 25%, Community Presentation 20%, and the BPAD was 15%. The testing company applied those weights which were approved by the Civil Service Commission and calculated the final score.

Commissioner Kiely asked are these scores in line with the ones we had seen before. Ms. Middleton responded they are a little more spread out. The last promotion process, the top three on the Lieutenants list were within a point of each other. Commissioner Kiely asked was there any other discussion about these reports? Ms. Middleton responded each candidate will receive their results by test component on how they fared against other scores. For each test component, each candidate will receive the highest, the lowest and average score along with their own score. Commissioner Kiely asked when the scores would go out. Ms. Middleton responded April 17, 2018.

Commissioner Trotter asked when looking at the spread between the top three and the bottom three were there any questions particularly supportive or non-supportive of the overall conclusion? Ms. Middleton responded we did not analyze to that degree. Chief DeMuth said he did notice those who were good presenters did well on both the Community Presentation and Role Play test components.

Approval of Lieutenant Eligibility List (EXHIBIT A)

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve the Lieutenant Eligibility list. Commissioner Trotter so moved and seconded by Commissioner Kiely and approved and recorded.

Certification of Lieutenant List of top 3 names

Chairperson Kiely asked for a motion to approve the Certification of Lieutenant List for top 3. Commissioner Trotter moved that we accept the top 3 candidates' final scores as recommendation. Ms. Middleton stated that Civil Service Rules state that when there is one vacancy we can look at three candidates. So, if we have one Lieutenant opening the top 3 can be considered for that promotion. Commissioner Kiely seconded and approved and recorded.

Approval of Sergeant Eligibility List (EXHIBIT B)

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve the Sergeant Eligibility List. Commissioner Trotter moved and seconded by Commissioner Kiely and approved and recorded.

Certification of Sergeant List of the top 3 names

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve the Certification of Sergeant List of the top 3 names. Commissioner Trotter moved and Commissioner Kiely seconded and approved and recorded.

Ms. Middleton stated that there was a 15 day protest timeframe. If someone protests within that timeframe, the Commission would need to convene to review the protest.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Commissioner Kiely adjourned the meeting at 4:50 p.m. and Commissioner Trotter second. Commissioner Kiely stated there was no immediate need to set a future meeting date.

Jeri E. Chaikin, Secretary

HRRM/CivilService/AgendasMinutes&Rules/Minutes/18-04-18

Tentative Time Line
For Fire Promotional Process
2019

June	CSC Meeting
June	Official Notice
Late July	Written Exam
15 days after written exam	Protest Period
Early Sept.	CSC Meeting (Protest)
End of Sept.	Results to candidates
10 days after results to candidates	Answer Sheet Inspection Period (last 10 days)
October	Assessment Center
Early Dec.	CSC Meeting (certify List)

EXHIBIT 1

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2017 POLICE ENTRY LEVEL
ELIGIBILITY LIST CERTIFIED - SEPTEMBER 14, 2017

New Ranking	Ranking	Last Name	First Name	Final Score		
	1	Charlton	Matthew	97.5926	Start 12/28/17	
1	2	Bunch	Steve	96.0741		
2	3	DeLuca	Nicholas	92.3704		
	4	Ridler	Jeffrey	91.4444	Withdrew	
3	5	Kvach	Mark	91.2593		
4	6	Vaughn	Michael	91.0741		
5	7	Whitworth	Arthur	91.0741		
6	8	Kovalick	Joseph	89.8889		
7	9	Pestyk	Daniel	89.6296		
8	10	Fowler	Ross	88.8519		
9	11	Royer	Cody	87.222		
	12	Thompson-Kropp	Matthew	87.000	Withdrew	
	13	Petrie	Luke	87.000	Withdrew	
	14	Thebald	Sarah	86.6296	Withdrew	
	15	Suliaman	Gahad	86.6296	Withdrew	
	16	Oklander	Alex	86.1852	Start 1/19/18	
	17	Funk	Adam	86.1111	Start 3/23/18	
	18	Bambauer	Matthew	85.7037	Withdrew	
10	19	Myers	Christopher	85.333		
	20	Whitsett	Joshua	84.7778	Start 1/19/18	
	21	Spronz	Nicholas	84.7778	Start 3/23/18	
11	22	Witthuhn, Jr.	John	84.037		
12	23	Collymore	Tasoni	83.8519		
	24	Caspio	Charles	83.6667	Start 1/19/18	
	25	Barnett	Caleb	82.2963	Start 3/23/18	
13	26	Davis	Robert	82.1852		
14	27	Yaar	Ahmad	82.111		
	28	Cox	Clyde	81.6667		
15	29	Pickens-Talley	Ryhan	81.2963		
	30	Howard, III	James	80.7037	Withdrew	
	31	Oblak	Jacob	80.3704	Withdrew	
	32	Mason	Joshua	80.333	Withdrew	
	33	Frantz	Jonathan	80.1852	Withdrew	
	34	Wunsch	Andrew	80.1481	Withdrew	
16	35	Ajieng	Lueth	79.963		
	36	Arnold	Christopher	79.8148	Withdrew	
17	37	Sefcik	Nicholas	79.7778		
	38	Thompson	Daniel	79.222	Start 8/17/18	
	39	Best	Jordan	79.0741		
18	40	Scherba	Volodymyr	78.037		

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
 2017 POLICE ENTRY LEVEL
 ELIGIBILITY LIST CERTIFIED - SEPTEMBER 14, 2017

New Ranking	Ranking	Last Name	First Name	Final Score		
	41	Kane	Michael	77.963	Withdrew	
	42	Attewell	Stephen	77.77778	Pending withdrawal	
	43	Continenza	Salvatore	76.8148	Withdrew	
	44	Knerr	Dustin	76.6296	Withdrew	
	45	Dugan III	Robert	76.4815	Start 9/17/18	
	46	Zetzer Jr.	Mark	76.444	Withdrew	
19	47	Jones	Issac	75.7407		
	48	Kemer	Andrew	75.3333	Withdrew	
20	49	Lowe	Amber	74.5926		
21	50	Eggleston	Carlo	73.5185		
22	51	Bucco	Anthony	73.1852		
23	52	Wilson	Kyle	73.111		
24	53	Knott	Cameron	72.9259		
25	54	Freels	Jeffrey	72.2963		
26	55	Kelley	Christopher	71.3704		
27	56	Allen	Nathan	70.3704		

Test Cycle Outcomes

	2007	2010	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Type of Test	Entry-Level	Entry-Level	Entry-Level	Lateral	Entry-Level	Entry-Level	Entry-Level
# of Applications received	103	84	254	31	223	50 (15 apps on waiting list)	66 (limit was 80)
# Names on Eligibility List	75	70	116	27	113	34	56
Ranking of lowest candidate hired	8	21	29	23	38	28	45
# of candidates hired	3	4	8	5	7	8	9
# of candidates hired currently in SHPD	3	0	6	3	7	8	9

Hired Demographics

	2007	2010	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017
Male	1	4	8	5	6	8	9
Female	2	0	0	0	1	0	0
Minority	0	0	2	2	1	2	2
Total Hires	3	4	8	5	7	8	9

2017 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Police Officer Structured Interview System (POIS) Plus additional Credit (Test Dates 8/22, 8/23, 8/24, 8/28, 8/30, 8/31, 9/5, 9/6, 9/7)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	44	9	12	3
# Failing	7	0	1	1
Pass Rate	86.27%	100.00%	92.31%	75.00%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	44/51=.8627*.8	69.00%		

2016 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Police Officer Structured Interview System (POIS) Plus additional Credit (Test Dates 11/14, 11/15, 11/17, 11/29, 11/30, 12/1)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	22	9	12	3
# Failing	11	5	5	0
Pass Rate	66.67%	64.29%	70.59%	100.00%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	22/33=.666*.8	53.00%		

2015 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Video-Based Exam Plus Additional Credit (Test Date 11/7/15)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	76	25	37	12
# Failing	28	33	40	7
Pass Rate	73.08%	43.10%	48.05%	63.16%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	76/104=.7308*.8	58.00%		

2013 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Video-Based Exam Plus Additional Credit (Test Date 4/13/13)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	100	25	35	10
# Failing	18	40	51	11
Pass Rate	84.75%	38.46%	40.70%	47.62%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	100/118=.8474*.8	68.00%		

2010 POLICE OFFICER COMBINED EXAMINATION SCORE

I/O SOLUTIONS / IPMA REPORT WRITING (Test Date = 8/21/10)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES
# Passing	58	11	18
# Failing	0	5	6
Pass Rate	100.00%	68.75%	75.00%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD			
	100 X .79 =	79.00%	

EXHIBIT 4

**CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2019 POLICE ENTRY-LEVEL EXAM COST COMPARISONS
BASED ON PURCHASING 50 EXAMS**

AGENCY	Type of Test	STUDY GUIDE COST	EXAM COST	SCORING SERVICE	SHIPPING	TOTAL (For one process)
International Public Management Association for Human Resources Alexandria, Virginia	Structured Interview System	N/A	\$11.00 per exam \$975.00 Base Package Fee 5% member discount	N/A	Free	\$1,448.75
						With discount
International Public Management Association for Human Resources Alexandria, Virginia	Written, Standard	\$10 per guide	\$15.00 per exam \$95.00 Admin. Fee plus 5% discount		\$50 plus \$.50 per candidate	\$1,382.50
Cuyahoga Community College Western Campus	Written, Standard portable	N/A	\$60.00 per candidate \$400.00 Admin. Fee		N/A	\$3,400.00
B-Pad Group, Inc.	Video , Internet link	N/A	\$60.00 per candidate \$900.00 Annual Fee		N/A	\$3,900.00

EXHIBIT 5