



SHAKER HEIGHTS

**Landmark Commission
Wednesday, January 23, 2019
7 P.M.
City Hall, Conference Room B**

Members Present: Nancy Moore, Council Member, Landmark Commission, Chair
Clifford Brown, Landmark Commission, Member
Ron Reed, Landmark Commission, Member
Thomas Starinsky, Landmark Commission, Member

Others Present: Cameron Roberts, Planner
Daniel Feinstein, Senior Planner

The meeting was called to order by Nancy Moore at 7:00 p.m.

Approval of the August 22, 2018 Meeting Minutes

It was moved by Mr. Brown and seconded by Mr. Reed to approve the minutes.

Ayes: All
Nays: None

Motion Carried

Certificate of Appropriateness: 2595 North Moreland Boulevard Unit 104— Window Replacements (Shaker Square Historic District). Melissa Hintz, Property Owner; represented by Chris Milowicki, Renewal by Anderson.

Mr. Roberts stated the case is for several window replacements at 2595 North Moreland Boulevard Unit 104. The property is located within the Shaker Square Historic District as part of the Larchmere Square Condominiums. The building was built in 1987 and relatively young compared to the overall age of the historic district.

Mr. Roberts said the unit currently has its original windows, which are dark bronze, wood casements clad in vinyl. The applicant is proposing to replace seven windows with Fibrex windows that will match in size, shape, color, and function. He explained that Fibrex is a composite material that has a much thinner frame, especially when compared to vinyl, which allows it to closely match the typical thin profile of a wood window. A thinner frame also allows more glass area to be present. Mr. Roberts mentioned that a representative from Renewal by Anderson, Chris Milowicki, is present to answer more detailed questions about the Fibrex material.

Mr. Roberts presented the location of the seven windows to be replaced.

Mr. Roberts continued, explaining that the Landmark Commission Window Standards generally allows windows that are deteriorated to be approved for replacement if the new windows match in terms of configuration, operation, details, material, and finish. He reiterated that the applicant is proposing a new material, but further explained that the Window Standards also state that variations in materials are permitted if the variations do not significantly affect the visual characteristics of the historic window. This also includes ensuring that the glazed area of the window is not reduced by more than 10%.

Mr. Roberts said the replacement Fibrex windows would be approximately 5/16" thicker than the existing wood windows. This would result in a 2.5% reduction in glazed area, which is well below the 10% threshold set by the Window Standards.

In terms of precedent, Mr. Roberts said an alternative window material has been previously approved once in the Shaker Square Historic District since the establishment of the Window Standards in 2002. This approval was for 13200 Fairhill in 2015, in which 80 vinyl windows were approved as replacements for original wood windows. Mr. Roberts expressed that a number of conditions accompanied this approval. Mr. Roberts also mentioned that the Landmark Commission has previously approved Fibrex windows as replacement windows for two properties: 3630 Fairmount in 2002 and 2007, and 3137 Van Aken in 2015.

Mr. Roberts stated that staff recommends approval of the window replacement application considering the following:

- The Fibrex material has a slim profile that will closely match the existing, original wood windows.
- The 2.5% reduction in glazed area is negligible and will not be conspicuous.
- The windows are casements and have no grids, which contributes to the small decrease in glazed area.
- The Landmark Commission has previously approved alternate window materials within the Shaker Square Historic District.
- The Landmark Commission has previously approved Fibrex windows as a replacement for wood windows.

Mr. Brown asked Mr. Milowicki, Renewal by Anderson representative, to further describe the Fibrex windows.

Mr. Milowicki presented a window sample and explained that Fibrex is a solid composite material that includes a percentage of reclaimed wood. He said Fibrex windows are the evolution of the current wood windows on the property, which were also manufactured by Anderson.

Mr. Brown asked if the applicant had received necessary approvals from the condominium association. Mr. Milowicki confirmed that they had.

Mr. Reed asked if the new windows would match the color of the other windows on the building. He expressed concern that the new windows would be easily distinguishable due to wear on the original windows that will remain. Mr. Milowicki confirmed that they the color would match and said fading on the existing windows is a minimal concern since the wood windows are clad in vinyl, which retains much of its color throughout the product's lifetime.

Mr. Starinsky asked if approval of this application would set a precedent for the rest of the building.

Mr. Roberts confirmed that approval of the application would set a precedent, but explained that unlike this unit, several other units have windows with muntins, which would likely need to be reviewed differently.

The Commission proceeded to discuss the history of the condominium development and the likelihood of the muntins on select units being original.

Mr. Reed suggested that staff research the history of the property and contact the building's architect to determine whether the muntins are original or a non-original window alteration. He expressed that he thinks they were added to the windows at a future time.

The Commission agreed that if the muntins are not original, then future window replacements on this building should match the original windows or be a material similar to Fibrex, and be casement windows with no muntins for conformity on the entire building.

Mr. Brown asked if any competitors have a product similar to the Fibrex.

Mr. Milowicki stated that no competitors have an identical material and the closest product for comparison would likely be fiberglass windows.

Mr. Feinstein mentioned that the application would be staff approved by the Architectural Board of Review.

Mr. Reed moved to approve the application with two conditions:

1. Any future replacement windows on the condominium building must match the original windows or be a material similar to the approved Fibrex material, as determined by Landmark Commission staff.
2. Landmark Commission staff will research the history of the condominium building to determine whether muntins in the windows of several units not pertaining to the application are original or a non-original window alteration.

Mr. Starinsky seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: All.
 Nays: None.

The Commission also agreed that comparable window replacement applications for other units on this building could be staff approved per the conditions mentioned.

2019 Certified Local Government (CLG) Grant Applications.

Mr. Roberts mentioned that the city has chosen to pursue two CLG grants, which is similar to the two successful grant applications submitted in 2018 for both the Shaker Historical Society and 18520 Winslow Road.

Ms. Moore explained that the request for these grant applications had already been approved by the Finance and Administration Committee and would be going to City Council the following week. She stated that the Committee felt comfortable submitting two grant applications based on last year's success and the Planning Department's exceptional record of receiving CLG grants over the years.

Mr. Roberts said the first grant application is in coordination with the City Hall Space Study and Plan project, which is an ongoing effort to co-locate Housing Inspection, currently in the Community Building, with the Building Department in City Hall. These departments were recently combined as one entity and there is a desire to have them co-located in order to improve departmental operations. The project also aims to rehabilitate the second floor firehouse attached to City Hall, which has been vacant for about 15 years. The space has extensive water damage, and is not habitable in its current condition. The city intends to renovate the space, which would in turn allow room for Housing Inspection to transfer to City Hall.

Mr. Roberts said the city has been working with the project consultant, Weber Murphy Fox, since July 2018. They have developed a number of draft layouts and provided cost estimates for the renovation work. There is a substantial gap between the amount that has been allocated for the project and the cost estimates that have been received. The most recent estimates range from \$600,000 to \$830,000, while only \$450,000 is budgeted for the project in 2019. A CLG grant would not be able to fully close this gap, but there is a consensus that it would help.

Mr. Roberts stated the grant would specifically be for repair work to 28 original, wood windows that have been identified. This work is estimated to cost \$18,700 and the consultant has an 8% design fee for all construction work. The City will be requesting \$19,700 in total to cover both of the expenses. The grant also requires a 40% match, which will be allocated from the \$450,000 currently allocated in the city's 2019 budget.

The Commission expressed a consensus of support for the grant application.

Mr. Roberts said the second CLG grant application would be for continuation of the Cleveland Restoration Society's (CRS) rehabilitation work at 18520 Winslow Road. The city and CRS were awarded a CLG grant of \$14,255 last year for work to this home. Since then, CRS took ownership of the property and they have done a significant amount of work to the exterior. He said Margaret Lann from the Cleveland Restoration Society is present to provide a presentation on the work they have done so far, share progress pictures, discuss items that remain, and talk about next steps.

Ms. Lann gave a brief presentation to the Commission. She mentioned there are two main items of work left for the exterior: building a new detached garage and restoring the driveway. Per the property's point of sale, the existing detached garage will be demolished and rebuilt. Secured bids for this work range from \$20,000 to \$25,000. The existing driveway will be excavated and new asphalt will be poured. The secured bid for this work is \$6,400.

Ms. Moore asked whether CRS had considered a concrete driveway as an alternative to the existing asphalt. Ms. Lann said they had not due to the expectation that concrete would be more expensive.

Ms. Moore said this is not always the case and that asphalt is usually more expensive to upkeep in the long run. She encouraged CRS to secure a bid for concrete. Ms. Lann said they would look into it.

There being no further comments or questions, Ms. Moore explained that this grant application will be for \$16,000 and the 40% match will be paid for by CRS.

Mr. Starinsky moved to approve the request to apply for, and accept, two CLG grants from the Ohio History Connection.

Mr. Brown seconded the motion.

Roll Call: Ayes: All.
 Nays: None.

Staff Approvals and Update Memo

Mr. Roberts said that from August 17, 2018 through January 17, 2019, 11 items received staff approvals. These were included in the meeting packet. Many were for the 18520 Winslow property rehabilitation work by the Cleveland Restoration Society.

Mr. Roberts also mentioned that staff has an update on 3125 Van Aken, a landmark property currently on the market.

Mr. Feinstein mentioned that staff have received several calls over the past month from potential buyers interested in learning more about landmark requirements for the home. In particular, there have been many questions about the steel casement windows on the home. He has been coordinating with the leasing agent and potential buyers to have a contractor visit the home and provide a quote for repair and/or replacement of the windows. He explained that through sharing this information in advance, staff hopes the future owner of the home will be adequately informed and committed to restoring the property properly.

Other Business

Ms. Moore said there is currently an open position on the Landmark Commission. Jan Devereaux stepped down as a member after an impressive tenure of serving the Commission and overall community for many years.

Ms. Moore explained that typically Planning Department staff would provide the city's administration with a select list of known candidates with expertise in historic preservation and recommend appointment of one of the candidates to the City's administration. She shared that this process has recently changed. The Mayor has decided to host an open call for interested residents in order to promote transparency and potentially find hidden talent. The city's new website will launch soon and will serve as a platform to allow residents to apply for the city's Boards, Commissions, Committees, and Task Forces. In the meantime, interested applicants are able to send a cover letter and resume to a designated city email address.

Ms. Moore encouraged the Commission to pass along this information to any individuals who they think may be a good fit for the Landmark Commission.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:02 p.m. The next meeting will be February 27, 2019.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Camm Roberts". The signature is written in a cursive style and is positioned above a horizontal line.

Cameron R. Roberts, Secretary
Landmark Commission