



SHAKER HEIGHTS

Civil Service Commission Agenda Via Zoom Webinar Thursday, January 7, 2021, 3:00PM

For the safety of staff and residents, in-person attendance is not permitted. Join the Zoom webinar as a viewer or listener from a PC, Mac, iPad, iPhone or Android device. Join online at <https://zoom.us/j/97740331087?pwd=eE9ST1BiRzBoZGpvQ21ldHpGVmRzQT09>
Password: 33553400; Description: Civil Service Commission; or join by phone at 833-548-0282 (toll free); Webinar ID: 977 4033 1087, International numbers available at <https://zoom.us/u/arc0G4kMx>

1. Approval of November 23, 2020 Meeting Minutes.

Documents:

[MINUTES112320.PDF](#)

2. Civil Service Commission Memo.

Documents:

[CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEMO.PDF](#)

3. Recommendation to cancel current Police Entry-Level Eligibility List.

Documents:

[EXHIBIT A - 2019 ELIGIBILITY LIST.PDF](#)
[EXHIBIT B TEST CYCLE OUTOMES.PDF](#)

4. Overview & Discussion of recommended Police Lateral Process.

Documents:

[EXHIBIT C - 2019 ADVERSE IMPACT BY TEST CYCLE.PDF](#)
[EXHIBIT D - 2021 POLICE EXAM COST COMPARISON.PDF](#)

5. Recommendation and approval of testing company.

6. Designate Chair for 2021.

7. Schedule next meeting date and time.

8. Adjournment

To request an accommodation for a person with a disability, call the City's ADA Coordinator at 216-491-1440, or Ohio Relay Service at 711 for TTY users.



**Civil Service Commission Minutes
Monday, November 23, 2020 at 3:00 P.M.
Via Teleconference - Zoom**

Members Present: Sandra I. Kiely, Chairperson
Ronald Fountain, Commissioner
Jeri E. Chaikin, Secretary

Note: Commissioner Lee Trotter had technical difficulties and was unable to attend.

Others Present: William Ondrey Gruber, Director of Law
Jeffrey DeMuth, Police Chief
Patrick Sweeney, Fire Chief
James Heath, Assistant Fire Chief
Sandra Middleton, Director of Human Resources
Patricia McCreary, Human Resources Senior Administrative Assistant

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Sandra Kiely at 3:00 p.m.

* * * *

Approval of the November 5, 2020 Meeting Minutes

Chairperson Kiely asked if there was a motion to approve November 5, 2020, meeting minutes moved by Commissioner Kiely and second by Commissioner Fountain and minutes were approved.

* * * *

Civil Service Commission Memo

Commissioner Kiely mentioned there is a civil service commission memo that was incorporated in our agenda from Sandy. Human Resources Director Sandra Middleton replied yes! Ms. Middleton explained the Memo is to outline the meeting agenda in detail.

* * * *

Discussion of Fire Battalion Chief Promotional Examination Results.

Ms. Middleton shared background information regarding the written examination that was postponed early spring, due to COVID-19. Subsequently, the written examination was held October the 10th with eight (8) participants. Everything went off without any glitches. Ms. Middleton mentioned ideally, we would like to give the candidates, their written examination scores before they go to the assessment center. We did not know if that was going to happen this time, but fortunately we did get their results back a few days before going to the assessment center. All eight (8) candidates received their written examination results, prior to going to the assessment center. The written examination is worth 40% of the overall grade. On November 13th, all eight (8) candidates participated in the assessment center that was held at Cuyahoga Community Corporate College and everything went on without a hitch there. Ms. Middleton

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS

mention that due to COVID-19, she normally tries to stay all day, but it was not wise to do that in a public setting, and all went as planned. The Assessment Center is worth 60% of the overall grade. Ms. Middleton mentioned that the assessment center results were sent to the commission, by Ms. McCreary, so you should have them, and I can answer any questions about them. Commissioner Kiely asked Commissioner Ron if he had access to them. Commissioner Fountain replied yes! Commissioner Kiely mentioned there are four sections here and asked Ms. Middleton if she wanted to discuss them or are, we just looking at the eligibility list. Ms. Middleton replied if you have any questions it is up to you, Madam Chair, whatever you like to do. Commissioner Kiely replied there is a wide range. Ms. Middleton explained the second tab shows how people faired on their written examination, which is worth 40% and their assessment center results and their overall ranking. The range was from 75.2 to 92.06, and it is very close. Ms. Middleton mentioned that the Chief Sweeney was very happy with the results, and he said you know; we cannot go wrong with any of these eight guys. They are all stellar employees, and we will whoever come to the top of the list. Fire Chief Patrick Sweeney stated it has been a real lengthy process for all these candidates and emphasizes with what Sandy said. We are really very fortunate that we have eight (8) candidates that took this examination and felt very comfortable promoting any one of them. They have all been very dedicated to this department, continued their professional development, all the way through making Lieutenant and some of these candidates have taken the Battalion Chief test in the past. Chief Sweeney mentioned one of the things we like when we utilize the Ohio Fire Chiefs Association for their exam they, give the candidates and us a profile report that outline their strengths and weaknesses throughout the assessment process. It gives them a roadmap as to what they can do moving forward. Chief Sweeney stated so, if they did not score very well, or they did not land at the top of the list, it gives them a tool to work on between now and the next time that they take a promotional exam. Chief Sweeney mentioned they started studying for the written exam back in December or January when the list was put out. Then COVID-19 hit, that really threw a monkey wrench into everything and out of fairness, to all of them, we put the brakes on the promotional process. Chief Sweeney stated we were not sure if one of them was going to get sick, one of their family members would cause some troubles or major distraction for them. Things were picked up in the fall. The Ohio Fire Chiefs Association brought in seven (7) assessors, and they were Fire Chiefs from throughout the state of Ohio from the Columbus and Cincinnati area. Candidates were put through a series of exercises, presented a qualification's presentation, test their ability dealing with fire management emergency skills with a complex or complicated emergency that was occurring in the city and how they would manage that. They dealt with personnel issues, tested their competence on how to deal with complicated personnel matters. One of the exercises they had to deal with was the current situation that we are dealing with the pandemic and how, the current policies and practices that we have implemented in the station, and how they are working, what can we do better. A lot of the real-world scenarios, administrative skills, presentation skills, leadership skills, organizational ability, and leadership traits were tested. Chief Sweeney mentioned the assessment is where we put a lot of weight into that because that is some real-world things that individuals are going to have to deal with. So that is how we came up with 60% of the score and it impacts these scores.

Chief Sweeney mentioned there will be a detailed report from the assessors and how individuals did in certain exercises so that we can sit down with them and this is how the assessors measured you in this exercise and these are the things that we should look to continue to do, or to improve upon. Ms. Middleton explain typically in normal times that report comes about a month or so after the assessment center, because it is very thorough. I would anticipate with the pandemic and as we near the holidays that we should probably get that 21 but could be surprised and get it in December. Commissioner Kiely said it sounds like overall, everyone was very pleased with how the process went. Chief Sweeney replied the process worked well; we do not have any concerns about how the testing process worked.

* * * *

Review Certification of Eligibility List for Fire Battalion Chief.

Commissioner Kiely asked that the Civil Service Commissioner is being asked to certify the Eligibility List is that correct? Ms. Middleton asked Law Director William Gruber do they certify the list or the top three. Director Gruber replied to approve the list. Ms. Middleton stated approve the list and certify the top three (3). Commissioner Fountain so move and Commissioner Kiely second and approved. Ms. Middleton addressed a few public attendees announcing that the results will be released immediately after this meeting, they are ready to go to individuals and the eligibility list will be given to the Chief. Commissioner Kiely asked Commissioners Fountain if he had any questions or comments otherwise, we would move on? Commissioners Fountain replied no.

* * * *

Designate Chair for 2021.

Chairperson Kiely the Commissioner is asked to designate a chairperson for 2021. Ms. Middleton stated the Civil Service Rule says each year you should designate a chair. So, if you do not mind doing this at this meeting or since we are missing a person, if you want to, hopefully we are going to have another meeting before the end of the year. We can table that to the next meeting if you like. Commissioner Fountain replied I think that is only fair. Ms. Middleton agreed with Commissioner Fountain. Commissioner Fountain replied I think it would be inappropriate to leave Lee out.

Ms. Middleton added one thing, we were hoping that we can get another meeting in early December. There is a need for a police test immediately and looking at Fire, not sure of the timing, but in 2021. So, we want to come to the Commission and to get approval of the testing companies. We do not have it ready today, but we will in a few weeks. So, hoping to schedule another meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:32 p.m. The next meeting will be December 7 at 3:00 p.m.

Jeri E. Chaikin, Secretary
Civil Service Commission



Memorandum

To: Members of Civil Service Commission
From: Sandra Middleton, Director of Human Resources
cc: Mayor David E. Weiss
Chief Administrative Officer Jeri E. Chaikin
Date: January 5, 2021
Re: January 7, 2021 Meeting

At the scheduled meeting on January 7, 2021, the Commission will be asked to approve the minutes from the November 23, 2020 meeting.

According to Civil Service Rules - **Section 6.1 Eligible Lists, Duration**

The Commission shall maintain or will establish a list of eligibles in each class in the classified service for which examinations are given. Each list shall remain in force for six (6) months from the date of its promulgation unless a new examination is held sooner; each list shall automatically renew every six months for a total of up to two years in force, unless the Commission takes action to the contrary.

A Police Entry-level Eligibility List was certified on September 23, 2019. This list contains 32 individuals who passed the entry-level examination. The City has hired six off the 2019 eligibility list and have vetted all remaining applicants on the list, The City is confident that the current list will not yield any additional hires. The City will request that the Commission cancel the existing list prior to its expiration of 9/23/2021.

The City will give an overview of past examination processes and the outcomes achieved over the past 13 years. The City will discuss the challenges faced by the Shaker Heights Police Department in retaining well-trained Officers and staying competitive and attractive in this environment of civil unrest and demands for police reform. The City will discuss the many attributes of being a Shaker Heights Police Officer that will be highlighted in our recruitment campaign such as working for an accredited organization, the wealth of training officers receive, the culture of the department, the education and fitness incentives and career development bonus. The City will provide an overview on the need to change the requirements to apply for this test to include all applicants must currently be employed with a law enforcement agency or be enrolled in a police officer academy.

The City will discuss the impact on the hiring process due to the pandemic. The stay at home advisory makes it impossible to utilize the Structured Interview Process that the City has used for testing in the past. The City will make a recommendation to use BPAD (Behavioral Personnel Assessment Device) as the testing company. The City has successfully utilized this company in the past for lateral entrance.

At the November 23 meeting, the Commission tabled the vote to designate a Chair until all members were present. The Commission will be asked to move to designate a chair for 2021.

CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2019
POLICE ENTRY LEVEL
ELIGIBILITY LIST CERTIFIED SEPTEMBER 23, 2019

Ranking	New Ranking	Last Name	First Name	Final Score	
1		Salvage	Trevor	91.8148	Withdrew
2		DePalma	John	91.2963	
3		Palm	David	90.5556	Hired 1/27/20
4		Sefeik	Nicholas	90.5185	Withdrew
5		Wills	Chardelle	90.0000	
6		Douglas, Jr.	Raymond	88.5185	Hired 8/24/20
7		Goldberg	Chad	88.1481	Hired 1/27/20
8		Leahy	James	87.5556	Hired 1/27/20
9		Joos	Blake	87.3704	
10		Estremera	Anthony	86.8148	
11		Palevich	Vincent	86.4815	
12		Mitri	Daniel	85.0741	Hired 1/27/20
13		D'Eusano	Andrew	83.8519	
14		Harris	Michael	83.7778	
15		Parish	Duane	83.7037	
16		Rice	Zackery	82.9630	
17		Chessar	Joseph	82.9259	
18		Ebert	Daniel	82.9259	
19		Fali	Havie	82.0370	Withdrew
20		Clark	Fristan	81.8519	Hired 1/27/20
21		Sorg	Parker	80.0000	
22		Jastatt	Michael	79.4074	Withdrew
23		Andexler	Joshua	79.4074	
24		Dunaway	Kaitlyn	78.3333	
25		Moore	Kevin	78.3333	
26		Calhoun	Taylor	78.1481	
27		Davis	Tyshaun	76.2593	
28		Hickerson Jr.	Raqib	75.0000	
29		Brito	Jeremy	74.6296	
30		Cilik	Trevor	74.2593	
31		Difranco	Ryan	73.6667	
32		Wolk	Marcus	71.9259	
		EXHIBIT A			

Test Cycle Outcomes

	2007	2010	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2019
Type of Test	Entry-Level	Entry-Level	Entry-Level	Lateral	Entry-Level	Entry-Level	Entry-Level	Entry-Level
# of Applications received	103	84	254	31	223	50 (15 apps on waiting list)	66 (limit was 80)	44 (limit was 50)
# Names on Eligibility List	75	70	116	27	113	34	56	32
Ranking of lowest candidate hired	8	21	29	23	38	28	45	20
# of candidates hired	3	4	8	5	7	8	9	6
# of candidates hired currently in SHPD	2	0	5	2	6	7	7	6

Hired Demographics

	2007	2010	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2019
Male	1	4	8	5	6	8	9	6
Female	2	0	0	0	1	0	0	0
Minority	0	0	2	2	1	2	2	1
Total Hires	3	4	8	5	7	8	9	6

2019 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Police Officer Structured Interview System (POSIS) Plus additional Credit (Test Dates 8/20, 8/21, 8/27, 8/28, 9/10, 9/19)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	20	8	11	3
# Failing	8	1	2	1
Pass Rate	71.43%	88.89%	84.62%	75.00%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	20/28=.7143*.8	57.00%		

2017 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Police Officer Structured Interview System (POSIS) Plus additional Credit (Test Dates 8/22, 8/23, 8/24, 8/28, 8/30, 8/31, 9/5, 9/6, 9/7)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	44	9	12	3
# Failing	7	0	1	1
Pass Rate	86.27%	100.00%	92.31%	75.00%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	44/51=.8627*.8	69.00%		

2016 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Police Officer Structured Interview System (POSIS) Plus additional Credit (Test Dates 11/14, 11/15, 11/17, 11/29, 11/30, 12/1)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	22	9	12	3
# Failing	11	5	5	0
Pass Rate	66.67%	64.29%	70.59%	100.00%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	22/33=.666*.8	53.00%		

2015 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Video-Based Exam Plus Additional Credit (Test Date 11/7/15)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	76	25	37	12
# Failing	28	33	40	7
Pass Rate	73.08%	43.10%	48.05%	63.16%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	76/104=.7308*.8	58.00%		

2013 POLICE OFFICER Examination

IPMA Video-Based Exam Plus Additional Credit (Test Date 4/13/13)

Using Passing Score of 70%

	WHITE	AF-AM	ALL MINORITIES	ALL MINORITIES EXCEPT AF-AM
# Passing	100	25	35	10
# Failing	18	40	51	11
Pass Rate	84.75%	38.46%	40.70%	47.62%
ADVERSE IMPACT THRESHOLD				
	100/118=.8474*.8	68.00%		

**CITY OF SHAKER HEIGHTS
2021 POLICE EXAM COST COMPARISONS
BASED ON PURCHASING 50 EXAMS**

AGENCY	Type of Test	STUDY GUIDE COST	EXAM COST	SCORING SERVICE	SHIPPING	TOTAL (For one process)
B-Pad Group, Inc.	Video , Internet link	N/A	\$60.00 per candidate \$250.00 Annual Fee		N/A	\$3,250.00
Industrial/Organizational Solutions	online exam - National	Available to be purchased by applicant	\$40 - \$65 per exam depends on selected exam membership fee			\$3,250 plus fee

EXHIBIT D

Exhibit 4