



**SAFETY AND PUBLIC WORKS COMMITTEE MINUTES  
FRIDAY, JANUARY 8, 2021  
8:00 AM  
VIA ZOOM MEETING**

Members Present: Robert Zimmerman, Council Chairperson  
Sean Malone, Council Member  
Carmella Williams, Council Member  
Earl Williams, Council Member  
Patricia Speese, Director Public Works  
Jeffrey DeMuth, Chief of Police  
Patrick Sweeney, Chief of Fire

Others Present: Mayor David E. Weiss  
Jeri Chaikin, CAO  
Joyce Braverman, Director of Planning  
Marilyn Kertis, Recording Assistant

The meeting was called to order by Council Chair Robert Zimmerman at 8:02 am.

Council Chair Zimmerman wished everyone a Happy New Year!

**APPROVAL OF DECEMBER 4, 2020 MEETING MINUTES**

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any questions, changes or additions to the December 4, 2020 Safety and Public Works Committee minutes. There being none, a motion was made by Council Member Carmella Williams, it was seconded by Council Member Earl Williams, and the minutes were approved.

**REQUEST FOR APPROVAL TO AWARD CONTRACT TO MS CONSULTANTS FOR DESIGN SERVICES FOR THE WARRINGTON ROAD WATER MAIN REPLACEMENT DESIGN**

**Patricia Speese, Director of Public Works**

Director Speese stated that in the fall of 2020, Public Works received funding from the Cleveland Water Suburban Water Main Renewal program to replace the water mains on Warrington Road (Southington Road to South Woodland Road). The Cleveland Water Department will pay for the total cost of the project on the condition that the City of Shaker Heights designs and manages the project.

Request for Proposals were sent to five (5) firms who have performed professional services in the City of Shaker Heights. The scope of work entails that the consultant prepare construction documents for the replacement of the waterline on Warrington Road. On October 30, 2020, the

City of Shaker Heights received seven (7) proposals. Each proposal was ranked by Quality Based Selection (QBS) as this is crucial in determining the most qualified consultant based on their project technical approach, staff and firm experience. The proposed fee was not part of the scoring. The proposals were ranked by Technical Approach (40 points); Project Team Experience (30 points); Firm Project Experience (30 points). After reviewing the proposals, it was determined that the ms Consultants understanding of the project requirements and technical approach was the most comprehensive of the SEVEN (7) proposals. Ms Consultants is also familiar with that area of town as their staff successfully designed the Huntington Water Main replacement and have worked on other projects with the Cleveland Water Department. The Warrington Water Main project has similar challenges as the Huntington Water Main Replacement project as well. The proposed project manager is also a resident of Shaker Heights and very familiar with the work limits and traffic constraints in that area.

Ms. Consultants initial fee was \$38,844 which was quite a bit higher than the other proposals. Public Works met with ms Consultants and explained they were happy with the proposal and their knowledge of the project but their bid was too high. Ms Consultants agreed to revise their bid to \$28,978 which was more in the ballpark of the more competitive bids. Public Works is very comfortable with ms Consultants and their bid.

Director Speese is requesting approval to enter into an agreement with ms Consultants for the Warrington Road Water Main Replacement Design for the amount of \$28,978.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any comments or questions. Council Member Malone asked what type of challenges there were with the Huntington project. More specifically, were there any challenges due to the design work from ms. Consultants. Director Speese indicated that there weren't specific challenges, more so the project was challenging overall because it involved the water line and the SSO sewer repair project. The main challenge became a conflict because of trees. Ms Consultants designed the project so there were no conflicts with trees, whether they had to move a water line or move connections to homes. The residents of the Huntington project were extremely inconvenienced but very patient. The Warrington project will not be as onerous since it won't include a sewer project at the same time but will include street resurfacing.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked what percent of the project would be the responsibility of the city of Shaker Heights and Director Speese indicated it would be 0 %.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any more comments or questions. There not being any, he asked for a motion to approve the resolution. A motion was made by Council Member Sean Malone and seconded by Council Person Carmella Williams and approved.

Council Chair Zimmerman commented on how appreciative he was that the process used to choose ms Consultants was very thorough and based on substance along with the ability to negotiate a competitive quote with their choice of consultants. By doing so, it benefits the residents in the community.

**REQUEST TO ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH DLZ FOR ENGINEERING SERVICES FOR LOMOND/LYNNFIELD SSO 11**

**Patricia Speese, Director of Public Works**

The City of Shaker Heights was awarded a grant through the Northeast Ohio Regional Sewer District (NEORS) Member Community Infrastructure Program (MCIP) for the design to mitigate the number of activations at the sanitary sewer overflow located at Lynnfield/Lomond intersection (SS) 11). The City's estimated cost for designing the project was estimated at \$225,000. The NEORS agreed to pay for half (1/2) of the design.

On November 2, 2020, Public Works distributed proposals to seven (7) consultants and the project was also posted on the City's website. Only three (3) consultants submitted proposals. Evaluations were performed by the Director of Public Works, Assistant Director of Public Works and Public Work's Superintendent. The City challenged the consultants to think outside the box and come up with some creative ideas. The project only covers approximately 20 acres but the impact will spread over a 230-acre area.

The Quality Based Selection (QBS) process was used to score the technical merits of the project and fee was not used during the scoring process. Scoring was based on Technical Approach (40 points); Project Team Experience (30 points); and Firm's Project Experience (30 points).

Although the scoring was close, DLZ rose to the top by providing a "sexy" design. This is a very complex project and impacts many residents. DLZ is the largest minority owned engineering firm in the country and they provided a lot of green infrastructure suggestions and agreed to provide interaction with the residents that will be impacted. The lead designer from DLZ has also worked with the Sewer District on a huge project called the Kingsbury Run project. He had really done his homework by studying previous projects and reviewed existing data and understood the challenges that were faced. He has also done previous work with the Sewer District in this area; therefore, Public Works was quite comfortable with DLZ's knowledge of the project. Their fee was the second highest of the proposals and more than the City had budgeted for. Director Speese indicated that DLZ was the firm that they wanted to use because of their in-depth knowledge and research of the project and approached DLZ about revising their proposal. Their initial fee was \$242,205.50, the second highest proposal but they revised their fee to \$229,897, which is closer to the City's budget. Director Speese reiterated how complex this project was and how DLZ was the right firm for the project.

Director Speese is requesting approval to enter into an agreement with DLZ for engineering services for the sanitary sewer overflow at Lynnfield/Lomond (SSO 11) in the amount of \$229,897. NEORS will reimburse City for \$112,500.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any comments or questions. Council Person Earl Williams indicated his knowledge of the Kingsbury Run project and that it was an old piece of sewer pipe for the cities of Shaker Heights and Cleveland. He asked if the City of Cleveland doing any upgrades? Director Speese indicated that the Sewer District has made several improvements and would have to approve this design. She was unsure if Cleveland has made any repairs or even if they do repairs.

Council Person Sean Malone asked if DLZ would provide an opportunity for public input regarding the project and wanted to know what the timeline is for the project. Director Speese indicated there will be community meeting but will take place closer to when the design is complete. The design has to be complete by the end of 2021. There may need to be the removal of approximately 9-14 trees on Lomond. She put out feelers to residents who indicated they would be happy for the city to do what is needed to resolve the sewer issues. She also spoke with Council member Moore who chairs the Tree Advisory Board who also agreed with the specifics. It is important to let the residents to know in advance before they seek the funding for projects and start taking down trees. The fall is a guess of when the meeting might take place.

Council Person Malone also asked what types of green ideas did DLZ propose? Rain gardens along tree lawns and area around Lomond Elementary School in addition to tree lawn areas with pervious surfaces for sidewalks that would lend to more sustainability to the area. There are also down spout connection issues which were also addressed.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any more comments or questions. There not being any, he asked for a motion to approve the Request to enter into an agreement with DLZ for Engineering Services for Lomond/Lynnfield SSO 11. A motion was made by Council Member Sean Malone and seconded by Council Person Carmella Williams and approved.

### **REQUEST TO ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH ODOT LPA RESURFACING OF CHAGRIN BOULEVARD RESURFACING**

**Patricia Speese, Director of Public Works**

The City of Shaker Heights received an award by the Northeast Ohio Areawide Coordinating Agency (NOACA) for the Local Public Agency Project (LPA), resurfacing of Chagrin Boulevard from the western city limit to the eastern limit but will not include approximately 300 feet of the new intersection at Chagrin Boulevard and Warrensville Center Road. ODOT construction could potentially start in July of 2022. The LPA program is a partnership between Federal Highway (FHWA), ODOT and local public agencies to develop, plan and construct projects with Federal, State and Local Funds. The City of Shaker Heights will administer this project which includes design, construction, inspection and management.

The first step is to enter into an agreement with ODOT for the resurfacing of approximately 2.09 miles of Chagrin Boulevard. The construction could potentially start July 1, 2022. Although it's called an 80/20 agreement, ODOT generally doesn't pay for much and it usually becomes a 60/40 agreement. The estimated cost for the project is \$2,659,996 which includes construction and construction administration/inspection. Design fees are not included. The design fee is anticipated to be \$212,800. Per NOACA, ODOT is capping their commitment at \$2,127,997. Although the City's portion would be \$531,999.00, its overall cost would be \$989,439.31, since the agreement does not cover the cost for items such as curbs, ADA Ramps, full depth repair and aprons. Therefore, the breakdown of the project ends up being more of a 65/35.

The design work needs to be done by 4<sup>th</sup> quarter of 2021. At this time Public Works is just requesting approval to enter into an LPA Agreement with ODOT for the Chagrin Boulevard Resurfacing Project.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any comments or questions. There being none, he asked for a motion to approve the Request to Enter into an LPA Agreement with ODOT for the Chagrin Boulevard Resurfacing Project. A motion was made by Council Member Carmella Williams, it was seconded Council Person Earl Williams, and the motion was approved.

**REQUEST FOR COUNCIL TO APPROVE NECESSARY LEGISLATION TO ENTER INTO A REVISED LPA AGREEMENT WITH ODOT TO COMBINE PROJECT ID 105725 AND 111119.**

**Joyce Braverman, Director of Planning**

Director Braverman indicated that in October, 2020, Council approved legislation for the City to combine PID 105725 (resurfacing on Warrensville Center Road from Fairmount Circle to Farnsleigh) and PID 112471 (resurfacing of Warrensville Center Road from the southern city limit to Norwood) into one project. With support from ODOT, we would now like to add PID 111119 (WCR/Shaker Intersection for reconfiguration) with PID 105725 into one project ID, combining all three projects. Combining the projects will minimize the inconvenience for the public and will also be a cost savings to the City of Shaker Heights. These were all separate projects that were approved individually (the first two) and now we would like to combine all three projects.

The combined total project cost is now \$\$3,000,480 for project eligible items. ODOT's maximum contribution is \$2,490,000 for eligible project costs. The City's contribution will be \$517,117 for eligible project costs. The City is also responsible for paying for design services of \$216,800 as well as non-eligible project costs of \$509,998. The projects have already been designed. For the Shaker/Warrensville project, there are 2 different funding sources; one is a 20% match and the other is a 0% match. Non-eligible expenses include curb and apron replacement. Inspection costs will be reimbursed.

The plan is to have Public Works advertise for the project in early 2021 with construction to begin in the spring with a full completion date to be in the fall of 2021. ODOT won't allow Shaker Heights to put the bid out until an agreement is approved by Shaker Heights and processed by ODOT. To keep this moving along, a special Council Meeting is being requested for 1/11/21, rather than waiting until the end of the month for the scheduled council meeting.

At this time, Director Braverman is requesting that City Council have a special council meeting on Monday, January 11, 2021, to approve necessary legislation to enter into a revised LPA Agreement with ODOT to Combine Project ID 105725 and 111119.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any comments or questions. Council Person Earl Williams asked if the cost would increase from the time city council approves the new legislation vs. when ODOT approves the project and what the tentative increases could be. Director Speese indicated the costs could increase by 10% if the bid didn't go out until March or later and would significantly increase the cost of whole project.

Council Person Malone asked if there was any concern that one giant project limits the number of people that can bid. If the projects remained individual, would more companies bid and would it affect the cost. Director Speese indicated that we only want large firms with more experience. When using several firms, each firm requires a mobilization cost which can range from \$15,000 - \$25,000; therefore, by using one firm, mobilization costs are reduced.

Council Person Carmella Williams asked if there are any concerns about the size of the project and timing and would larger firms be too busy to handle the project. Director Speese suggested that the main reason to go out to bid early is so that our project will be at the top of someone's list and will be ready to begin the project when the weather permits in early spring.

Council Chair Zimmerman asked if there were any more comments or questions. There not being any, he asked for a motion to approve Malone moved to approve, seconded by Carmella Williams and approved.

In closing, Council Chair Zimmerman discussed the snow storm that took place on Christmas Eve and Christmas Day this past December and how it put a damper on the holiday for the Public Works crew. He asked Director Speese to comment about how the staffing was done. She indicated how the entire staff juggled their schedules to make sure the younger employees were able to be home with their families for Christmas. There were three (3) twelve (12) hour rotations and the entire crew did what needed to be done to get the roads cleared. Her staff is very committed and take their job seriously to keep the residents of Shaker Heights safe.

Council Chair Zimmerman also acknowledged the commitment of the Police Department and Fire Department and appreciates everything they do to keep the community safe and secure.