



## Memorandum

To: Members of City Council  
From: Director of Public Works, Patricia Speese  
cc: David Weiss, Mayor  
Jeri Chaikin, CAO  
Date: January 20, 2021  
Re: **Professional Services for Warrington Rd. Water main Replacement design**

---

In the fall of 2020, Public Works received funding from Cleveland Water Suburban Water Main Renewal program to replace the water mains on Warrington Road (Southington Rd to South Woodland). Cleveland Water (CWD) has agreed to pay for this project on the condition that the City of Shaker Heights design and manage the project. CWD will pay the City the total costs of the design and construction. The City agreed to administer this project but must first have the waterline designed.

Request for Proposals were sent to five (5) firms who have either performed professional services in the City before or have demonstrated an interest and the qualifications in waterline design and posted on the City's website. The scope of work entails that the consultant prepare construction documents for the replacement of the waterline on Warrington Road. On October 30, 2020 the City of Shaker Heights received seven (7) proposals.

The proposals were reviewed by Public Works staff using the following criteria:

- Technical approach (40 points): Proposals are initially ranked on technical approach. Proposals show the firm understands the project scope and how the firm intends to solve the design problem. Also included are any alternate design / construction methodologies especially those that could save the City money in the construction phase of the project.
- Project team experience (30 points): This section includes information on each team member's experience on similar projects and an organizational chart. Firms only include team members who will be available to work on the project once the project begins. This section also includes the firm's quality control methodology.
- Firm project experience (30 points): This section includes the firm's project experience on similar projects. The firm provides estimated construction costs for the project including data for estimated costs of the project.

The average review scores are as follows:

<b>FIRM</b>	<b>AVERAGE SCORE</b>
ms Consultants	95
GPD Group	93
DLZ	93
Osborne Engineering	90
Poggemeyer Design Group	87
K.E. McCartney & Associates	84
Karpinsky Engineering	79

As we follow a Quality Based Selection (QBS) process, the proposed fee was not part of the scoring criteria. Quality Based Selection is a process to determine the most qualified consultant based on their project technical approach, staff and firm experience. A crucial factor to the QBS process is the proposed fee is not a criterion in determining which consultant should be award the contract. After review of the proposals, it was determined that the ms Consultant’s understanding of the project requirements and technical approach was the most comprehensive of the five proposals received.

The factors that differentiated ms Consultant’s from the other consultants consisted of:

1. ms Consultant’s proposed staff successfully designed the Huntington Water Main replacement. The Warrington Water Main project has similar challenges such as making the tie-in connection at S. Woodland. ms Consultant’s demonstrated their ability to design practical solutions to complex problems under the previous project.
2. It was clear that ms Consultant’s had invested a high level of effort to review existing data and perform site visit(s). The proposed project manager is a Shaker resident and is very familiar with the work limits, traffic constraints because of school transportation, and the necessity for proper restoration requirements.

On November 20, Public Works had a virtual meeting with ms Consultant’s team to review the project and better understand their approach. During the conversation, it was clear that ms Consultant’s understands the City expectations, knows the process for submitting plans to CWD and has the availability to start the project after the contract is executed. ms Consultant’s project approach is consistent with other waterline designs that have been completed by the City. ms Consultant’s submitted proposed fee was \$38,844; we requested for the consultant to revise their fee to be in alignment with the other consultants. Showing their commitment to the project, the consultant provided a revised fee of \$28,978.

After scoring the different firms, Public Works reviewed the proposed fees. The fee submitted by each firm is as follows:

FIRM	Proposed Fee	
ms Consultants	\$38,844	\$28,978 (Revised)
GPD Group	\$23,600	
DLZ	\$32,125	
Osborne Engineering	\$32,320	
Poggemeyer Design Group	\$33,650	
K.E. McCartney & Associates	\$29,946	
Karpinsky Engineering	\$12,705	

This request was unanimously approved at the January 8, 2021 Safety & Public Works Committee meeting. Councilman Malone asked about the Huntington Road Project, and it was explained that the Huntington Road project was a very large project since it included major sewer repair for the Sanitary Sewer Overflow along with the watermain replacement. Chairman Zimmerman expressed his appreciation for the negotiation of the fee.

This request was unanimously approved at the January 18, 2021 Finance Committee Meeting. The question was raised if CWD had any concerns about the City not going with the lowest bidder. If a city is administering the project, CWD is fine with them using their purchasing guidelines.

Based on their understanding of the project, proposed project team, and technical approach, we request approval to award the contract to ms Consultant's for design services for the Warrington Road Waterline Project in the amount of \$28,978. We request that this legislation be passed as an emergency and under suspension of the rules so that design can begin as soon as possible.

ORDINANCE NO.

BY:

Authorizing a contract with ms Consultants in the total not to exceed amount of \$28,978 for professional design and related personal services for the Warrington Road Waterline Design Project, and declaring an emergency.

WHEREAS, the Cleveland Division of Water has agreed to fund the replacement of the Warrington Road water main, through the Cleveland Water Suburban Water Main Renewal program, which replacement project is to be designed and managed by the City of Shaker Heights; and

WHEREAS, to design the waterline replacement project a Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued to five firms; and

WHEREAS, on October 30, 2020, ms Consultants submitted a proposal for professional design and related personal services for the Warrington Road Waterline Project, and the proposal of ms Consultants has been determined to offer the best proposal and also meets the budget requirement; and

WHEREAS, pursuant to Section 141.03 of the Codified Ordinances, the Director of Public Works has recommended the acceptance of the proposal properly submitted by ms Consultants in the total not to exceed amount of TWENTY-EIGHT THOUSAND NINE HUNDRED SEVENTY-EIGHT DOLLARS (\$28,978) for professional design and related personal services for the Warrington Road Waterline Design Project.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT ORDAINED by the Council of the City of Shaker Heights, State of Ohio:

Section 1. The Mayor is hereby authorized to enter into a contract with ms Consultants in the total not to exceed amount of TWENTY-EIGHT THOUSAND NINE HUNDRED SEVENTY-EIGHT DOLLARS (\$28,978) for professional design and related personal services for the Warrington Road Waterline Design Project. Said contract shall be in the form as approved by the Director of Law.

Section 2. This ordinance is hereby declared to be an emergency measure necessary for the immediate preservation of the public peace, health, safety and welfare for the reason that it is necessary in the current operation of the City, and so that the design work can begin immediately, and, therefore, this ordinance shall take effect immediately upon its enactment and approval by the Mayor.

Enacted

Approved this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2021.

\_\_\_\_\_  
DAVID E. WEISS, Mayor

Attest:

\_\_\_\_\_  
JERI E. CHAIKIN  
Clerk of Council

coun20/0120msconsultantswarringtonwaterlinedesign